

Audit Committee 26 June 2013

Report from the Director of Finance and Corporate Services

Wards Affected: ALL

Internal Audit Annual Report 2012/13

1. Summary

1.1. This report is the annual report from the Head of Internal Audit. The report includes an opinion on the overall adequacy and effectiveness of the Council's internal controls and presents a summary of the audit work undertaken during the year.

2. Recommendations

2.1. The Audit Committee note the content of the report.

3. Detail

- 3.1. The Accounts and Audit Regulations 2011¹, as amended, require the Council to maintain an adequate and effective system of internal audit of its accounting records and of its system of internal control. The role of internal audit is to provide an independent and objective opinion on the control environment within the Council. Internal audit work is undertaken in accordance with the CIPFA Internal Audit Code of Practice 2006² ("the code"). The code sets out a number of elements to be included in an annual report from the Head of Audit. These are:
 - An opinion on the overall adequacy and effectiveness of the internal control environment
 - Any qualifications to the opinion
 - A summary of audit work undertaken
 - Any issues particularly relevant to the Annual Governance Statement
 - A comparison of the work undertaken against the plan and performance issues

- A comment on compliance with the CIPFA code
- **3.2.** A new code for internal audit has been developed across the private and public sectors. The Public Sector Internal Audit Standards (PSIAS) are in force from 1st April 2013 and compliance is required during the current year. The changes arising from this new code will be set out in a report to the committee later in the year.

Opinion of the Head of Audit and Investigations

3.3. "I have considered all of the work conducted by internal audit staff, the council's audit contractor, Deloitte and Touche Public sector Internal Audit Ltd and fraud investigation staff for the year ended 31 March 2013 and work undertaken post year end. This includes oversight of all internal audit reports and fraud investigations and personal conduct of specific projects. In my opinion, with the exception of those issues set out in paragraph 3.1 and within those areas where limited or nil assurance reports have been issued, the controls in place in those areas reviewed are adequate and effective. Where weaknesses have been identified within internal audit reports, these are being addressed by management and followed up by Internal Audit.

Qualifications to the Opinion

3.1. Within Children and Families there has been an instance of incorrect accounting information being reported to improve the appearance of year end deficit positions. This resulted in an understatement of overspend by £1,000,000 in the placements budget. This area is part of the One Council Savings programme.

Summary of Work Undertaken - Audit

- 3.2. The final 2012/13 Audit Plan was approved by the Audit Committee on 27th June 2012³. The plan allocated 1200 audit days across all areas of the council's operation, including 154 within Brent Housing Partnership.
- 3.3. At the end of March 2013, 1,160 days had been delivered representing 97% of the audit plan. The outstanding 40 days relate, primarly, to work which was withdrawn due to the move to the civic centre.
- 3.8 Audit work focused on the reliability of the financial and operational information, management accounting controls, safeguarding of assets, economy and efficiency of operations and review of compliance with relevant statutes and Council regulations.
- 3.4. For each audit where controls have been analysed, an assurance statement is issued. This simple grading mechanism provides an indication of the level of confidence in the controls in operation and the extent to which they are being applied. Each category is defined below:

| Full Assurance | There is a sound system of control designed to achieve the client's objectives. The control processes tested are being consistently applied. |
|--------------------------|--|
| Substantial Assurance | While there is a basically sound system of internal control, there are weaknesses, which put some of the client's objectives at risk. There is evidence that the level of non-compliance with some of the control processes may put some of the client's objectives at risk. |
| Limited Assurance | Weaknesses in the system of internal controls are such as to put the client's objectives at risk. The level of non-compliance puts the client's objectives at risk. |
| No Assurance | Control processes are generally weak leaving the processes/systems open to significant error or abuse. Significant non-compliance with basic controls leaves the processes/systems open to error or abuse. |

3.5. It is positive to note that there has been an improvement in the balance between limited and substantial assurance as set out below:

| | Full | Substantial | Limited | None |
|---------|-------|-------------|----------|--------|
| 2011/12 | - | 43% (22) | 50% (26) | 8% (4) |
| 2012/13 | 4%(2) | 64% (37) | 28% (16) | 4% (2) |

3.6. The following table indicates the audits completed and relevant levels of assurance during the 2012-13 financial year:

| Ref | Audit Area | Level of Assurance |
|-----|--|--------------------|
| 1. | Financial Planning | Full |
| 2. | Cash & Banking | Full |
| 3. | Council Tax | Substantial |
| 4. | NNDR (Buisness Rates) | Substantial |
| 5. | Housing & Council Tax Benefits | Substantial |
| 6. | Treasury Management | Substantial |
| 7. | Payroll | Substantial |
| 8. | Accounts Receivable | Substantial |
| 9. | General Ledgeer | Substantial |
| 10. | Pension Fund Administration | Substantial |
| 11. | College Green Nursery | Substantial |
| 12. | Furness Primary School | Substantial |
| 13. | Lyon Park Junior School | Substantial |
| 14. | St Mary's CE Primary School | Substantial |
| 15. | Oliver Goldsmith Primary School | Substantial |
| 16. | Convent of Jesus & Mary Primary School | Substantial |
| 17. | Roe Green Infants | Substantial |
| 18. | Roe Green Juniors | Substantial |
| 19. | St Josephs Infants | Substantial |
| 20. | St Joseph's Juniors | Substantial |
| 21. | St Joseph's RC Primary School | Substantial |
| 22. | Newfield Primary School | Substantial |
| 23. | Elsley Primary School | Substantial |
| 24. | St Mary Magdalen School | Substantial |
| 25. | Preston Manor Secondary School | Substantial |
| 26. | St Gregory's Secondary School | Substantial |
| 27. | The Village School | Substantial |
| 28. | Phoenix Arch | Substantial |
| 29. | Fawood Children Centre | Substantial |
| 30. | Manor School | Substantial |
| 31. | Property Disposals | Substantial |
| 32. | Building Control & Enforcement | Substantial |
| 33. | Partnership Management | Substantial |

| 34. | Public Sector Reform – Policy & Key Legislative Changes | Substantial |
|-----|--|--------------------|
| 35. | Capital Projects (contract audits) | Substantial |
| 36. | Automated Customer Contact (IT) | Substantial |
| 37. | Wireless Networks (IT) | Substantial |
| 38. | Safeguarding (Children) | Substantial |
| 39. | Libraries (Children) | Substantial |
| 40. | Appointment of Consultants & Non Agency Staff | Limited |
| 41. | Comensura | Limited |
| 42. | Oyster Cards | Limited |
| 43. | Chalkhill Primary School | Limited |
| 44. | Accounts Payable | Limited |
| 45. | Stonebridge Primary School | Limited |
| 46. | Granville | Limited |
| 47. | Mayor's Office | Limited |
| 48. | Language Shop | Limited |
| 49. | Mental Health Partnership | Limited |
| 50. | Home Care | Limited |
| 51. | Appointeeship & Receivership | Limited |
| 52. | Personal Budgets and Direct Payments (ASS) | Limited |
| 53. | High Value Contracts – Compliance with Blue Book | Limited |
| 54. | Northgate SX3 Housing Benefits System (IT) | Limited |
| 55. | IT Service Management (ICT Infrastructure Library) | Limited |
| 56. | Torah Temimah | Nil |
| 57. | Newman Cathilic College | Nil |
| 58. | Reform of Council Tax Benefit | Non Assurance Work |
| 59. | Olympics | Non Assurance Work |
| 60. | Civic Centre Project (Move to Civic Centre) | Non Assurance Work |
| 61. | Staff Expenses | Non Assurance Work |
| 62. | Housing Rents (BHP) | BHP |
| 63. | CAM Estate (Major Works Contract) | BHP |
| 64. | The Grove (Major Works Contract) | BHP |
| 65. | Procurement & Contracts (Non-Major Works) | BHP |
| 66. | Rent Arrears Management | BHP |
| 67. | Internal Financial Controls | BHP |

| 68. | Tenant Management Organisations – Watling Gardens | ВНР |
|-----|---|-----|
| 69. | Tenant Management Organisation – Kilburn Square Co-op | ВНР |
| 70. | Housing Repairs & Maintenance | BHP |
| 71. | Management of Non-Brent Properties | BHP |
| 72. | V5 System (Housing Rents) | BHP |

Summary of Work Undertaken - Fraud

- 3.7. In addition to internal audit work, the Audit and Investigation Team has responsibility for fraud and other investigation across the council. Fraud can impact upon the council's finances and may have implications for the systems of internal control.
- 3.8. Fraud affecting the council can be split between internal, committed by staff, or external, committed by third parties. As with all other large institutions in both the public and private sector, the council suffers from both.
- 3.9. The fraud case load is split over seven main areas. The 2012/13 case load statistics are shown in table 2 below.

| Fraud Area | New | Cases | Cases | Fraud |
|------------------------|-------|--------|--------------|------------|
| | Cases | Closed | Investigated | Identified |
| Housing Benefit* | 666 | 622 | 190 | 121 |
| Housing Tenancy | 206 | 227 | 222 | 59 |
| Related | | | | |
| Blue Badge | 28 | 23 | 23 | 10 |
| | | | | |
| Other external / third | 37 | 17 | 8 | 2 |
| party | | | | |
| Internal | 47 | 42 | 41 | 18 |
| Totals | 984 | 931 | 484 | 222 |

- 3.10. In relation to housing benefit fraud the team completed investigations into 190 cases with fraud proven in 121 cases. The value of fraudulent overpayments (including DWP benefits) created as a result of investigations in 2012/13 was £2.45 million. Of this amount, £1.78 million relates to housing or council tax benefit.
- 3.11. In relation to housing tenancy fraud the team received 206 new referrals and completed investigations into 222 cases. As a result of these investigations the team recovered 57 properties. Including 5 managed by housing

associations. These recoveries have a significant financial impact on the housing revenue account and temporary accommodation budget.

- 3.12. Blue Badge fraud continues to be an issue for the council and, although is a relatively low value offence, it has a high profile with members of the public. This abuse takes a number of forms. The lowest level is misuse of a badge by a family member when the badge holder is not present. This abuse is normally dealt with by the parking enforcement team. More serious offences such as persistent misuse, false applications for a badge, forged or counterfeit badges or misuse by a council officer are dealt with by Audit and Investigations. The team completed 23 investigations during the year resulting in 8 warnings and 2 prosecutions. There were an additional two cases involving staff members who both resigned pending disciplinary.
- 3.13. In relation to internal fraud there were 41 investigations completed during the year. Fraud or irregularity was established in 18 of these cases resulting in 5 dismissals at disciplinary, 10 resignations and 2 warnings.
- 3.14. In addition, the team undertook a proactive exercise to identify bogus student discounts for council tax. This resulted in the cancellation of £84,000 of in year discount.
- 3.15. A more detailed review of fraud work is included in the internal audit year end progress report which is included within the agenda for this meeting.

Issues relevant to the Annual Governance Statement

3.16. The issue set out in paragraph 3.1 is relevant to the annual governance statement.

Compliance with the CIPFA Code of Practice for Internal Audit in Local Government

- 3.17. The CIPFA Code of Practice² is a non-statutory code. However, the Accounts and Audit Regulations 2011¹, require the Council to maintain an adequate and effective system of internal audit in accordance with proper internal audit practices. The guidance accompanying the Accounts and Audit Regulations specifies that proper practices are those contained within the CIPFA code. Internal Audit is, therefore, required to comply with the code.
- 3.18. The elements of the code are reflected in the Terms of Reference for Internal Audit which have previously been approved by this committee at its meeting on 29th September 2010⁴. The Internal Audit Team works in accordance with these standards and has a quality control mechanism which involves an internal quality review of all audit reports and ongoing supervision and appraisal of all staff.

4. Financial Implications

4.1. None

5. Legal Implications

5.1. None

6. Diversity Implications

6.1. None

7. Background Papers

- 1. Accounts and Audit Regulations 2011
- 2. Code of Practice for Internal Audit in Local Government in the United Kingdom 2006 CIPFA
- 3. REPORT FROM THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE INTERNAL AUDIT PLAN FOR 2012-13, *Audit Committee – 27th June 2012.*
- Report from the Director of Finance and Corporate Resources Internal Audit Terms of Reference and Strategy, *Audit Committee – 29th September* 2010.

8. Contact Officer Details

Simon Lane, Head of Audit & Investigations, Room 1, Town Hall Annexe. Telephone – 020 8937 1260

Mick Bowden Deputy Director of Finance and Corporate Services